PRESIDENT'S EXPORT COUNCIL

+ + + + +

TUESDAY DECEMBER 10, 2024

+ + + + +

The President's Export Council met at the Eisenhower Executive Office Building, 1650 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, D.C., at 10:30 a.m., Mark Ein, Chair, presiding.

MEMBERS

MARK EIN, Chaiman, Kastle Systems; Chair ROSALIND BREWER, Former CEO, Walgreens Boots Alliance; Vice Chair KEISHA LANCE BOTTOMS, Former Mayor of Atlanta BRIAN BRYANT, International President, International Association of Machinists and Aerospace Workers BRETT HART, President, United Airlines BRETT ISAAC, CEO & Co-Founder, Navajo Power FARNAM JAHANIAN, President, Carnegie Mellon University PAUL LAUDICINA, Chairman Emeritus, Kearney RICH LESSER, Global Chair, Boston Consulting Group PATRICK E. MURPHY, Executive Vice President, Coastal Construction Group MIKE ROMAN, Executive Chairman, 3M DANIEL ROSEN, Chief Executive Officer, Rosen Partners LLC MICHELLE SINGER, Senior Vice President for Political Engagement, Comcast Corporation

ALSO PRESENT

DON GRAVES, Deputy Secretary, U.S. Department of Commerce

XOCHITL TORRES SMALL, Deputy Secretary, U.S. Department of Agriculture

- DAVID TURK, Deputy Secretary, U.S. Department of Energy
- NANI COLORIETTI, Deputy Director, Office of Management and Budget

DILAWAR SYED, Deputy Administrator, Small Business Administration

- MARISA LAGO, Under Secretary for International Trade, U.S. Department of Commerce
- SCOTT NATHAN, Chief Executive Officer, U.S. International Development Finance Corporation
- AMY HOLMAN, Acting Assistant Secretary for Economic and Business Affairs, U.S. Department of State
- THEA LEE, Deputy Under Secretary for the Bureau of International Labor Affairs, U.S. Department of Labor
- ANDREW PETRISIN, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Multimodal Freight, U.S. Department of Transportation
- ELLIE COLLINSON, Deputy Director and Chief Operating Officer, U.S. Trade and Development Agency
- OWEN HERRNSTADT, Member of the Board of Directors, Export-Import Bank of the United States
- ELIZABETH BALTZAN, Senior Advisor, Office of the United States Trade Representative
- HEATHER BOUSHEY, Member, Council of Economic Advisers

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

10:31 a.m.

CHAIR EIN: Good morning, everyone. Thank you for being here, and welcome to the fourth and final meeting of President Biden's Export Council. I'm Mark Ein, the Chairman of the PEC, and it's a pleasure to be back here with all of you again today. I know I speak for everyone on the PEC that it's been a real honor to serve the President and the country in this role.

We're going to have time at the end for our expressions of gratitude, and reflections on our term, but I do want to express our appreciation to the President for reconvening this council after a break of nearly seven years. To Secretary Raimondo and her team, Under Secretary Graves for their team, for their leadership, and steadfast support.

And to all of our members, and their staffs for their tireless and quality work that let us accomplish so much in such a short period

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

of time. I also want to thank, and I'll say in a little bit, my partner in this, Vice Chairman Brewer, thank you for your friendship and partnership.

Since the spring of last year we've had four in person council meetings that led to eight recommendations to the President, including today's, a PEC delegation trip with the Secretary to Thailand and the Philippines, there were over 30 virtual meetings over 20 months in preparation for that work that involved over 100 people participating.

So, this has been the definition of a team effort, and I know we're all really proud of where we've ended up. It's fitting that our last topic in today's meeting, and the only topic is on AI, which itself almost has singular focus across industries, companies, governments, and institutions not just in the United States, but across the world.

AI is also an industry where export

policy will play a huge role in deciding its future. Not a day goes by where we don't hear will about. how ΑT be one of the most. transformative, and potentially disruptive, technologies the world has ever seen, and how this is a moment where the winners, be it companies or countries, may be largely decided.

In fact, I actually just got back yesterday from a business conference in Abu Dhabi where AI was the dominant topic, and they actually talked extensively about how AI was that country's single biggest opportunities to build companies, grow existing ones, and be a catalyst for their whole economy, and for their population to prosper.

They mentioned in that conference that America was the leading country in the world when it came to AI, but also that China was chasing us aggressively. And so, with that as a backdrop, I'm very pleased by the fact that we're going to be taking up this topic today and by the extensive

(202) 234-4433

set of proposals contained in the AI recommendation that Dr. Jahanian will introduce today.

I hope it provides a road map for how our government and our industries can work together to make sure that the United States preserves our AI leadership long into the future. I'll now turn it over to my friend, and PEC Co-Chair, Ros Brewer.

VICE-CHAIR BREWER: Thank you, Mark. As we approach this fourth and final meeting, and reflecting on the last 21 months, it is important for us to realize that we have built on something that was already strong and already under work for us. And I reflect a lot on our trip to Thailand and how we walked into those meetings, and had the support of Secretary Raimondo.

And how the country opened up to us, and the discussions became very strong, very deep, very personal, and we found a lot of connected tissue between the two entities. I

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

will say that of the eight recommendations, this one has surfaced in AI as probably one of the most significant.

And it starts from the work that was done on the CHIPS and Science Act, and the thought around open science. And my hope for the work that was done here is that it will carry on, that it won't be sitting on a shelf as a piece of paper, and that we'll all bring reality to it. And I feel optimistic about that because the work that we've done between public and private partnerships has been very strong.

So, I'd like to thank everyone who has contributed. And today's discussion that Dr. Jahanian will lead has us all sort of energetic about what AI can deliver, but also thoughtful about how we take this away from here as independent individuals, and understand how this can actually grow the work around our country, it's very significant.

So, I'm going to move on, and allow

the Deputy Secretary Torres Small to take the program.

DEPUTY SECRETARY TORRES SMALL: Thank you so much, Vice Chair Brewer. It's an honor to get to be here, and a joy. I do believe, but Deputy Secretary Graves, I think you were next, if you -- yeah, we'll pass it over to you.

VICE-CHAIR BREWER: My apologies.

DEPUTY SECRETARY GRAVES: That is quite all right, we've known each other a little while, so it's not an issue. And it's actually fitting that we're sitting here in this room. Ι think it was, I don't know, eight years ago or so assisting me when Ros was from her perch, corporate perch helping to guide me when I was running the President's Jobs Council in the Obama administration, and she gave phenomenally good advice.

I will say that the advice that this organization, this group has provided is just stunning. I have had the chance to review all

of the sets of recommendations that you provided, and I want to thank you all for being here, and thank you for your leadership, thank you for your guidance.

This fourth and final meeting of the President's Export Council in this administration. Ι also want to thank my colleagues, and partners, and co-conspirators at times, many of whom are fellow deputies. But a sincere thanks to both of you, Mark and Ros, and the entire PEC for all that you've done.

Your dedication towards advancing U.S. competitiveness I think has been not just extraordinary, but it's laying the groundwork for a real opportunity for American workers, for job creation, for the support and growth of our communities, ensuring that we continue to lead the world both economically, but also with the power of our vision.

We take the recommendations of the PEC to heart, and it's allowed us to make fairly

significant progress on a range of pressing issues, and challenges facing the country. We've strengthened our competitiveness by revitalizing domestic manufacturing, promoting clean energy solutions.

improved trade facilitation We've thanks to your interventions, increased agricultural exports so that American farmers can access new markets, and thrive in a competitive And as a direct result of that fact landscape. finding trip to Thailand, we've deepened a really and crucial important bilateral commercial relationship that I think as we go forward in that region of the world, is going to be absolutely vital to the effectiveness of the United States.

It's increased our economic presence in the Indo-Pacific, and I think that's going to be extremely important for this country as we continue to face increasingly more difficult global headwinds. Your efforts aren't just about

(202) 234-4433

opening markets though. They're about building long term partnerships that we need that reinforce economic stability.

That create opportunities for American businesses to grow, and ensure that American workers have the opportunities that they need to succeed, and their families to succeed as well. So, it's been a pleasure to have been a part of this work, and I know that the Secretary, were she not feeling so poorly today, would absolutely rather that she be in this seat than me.

But I am grateful that I have had the opportunity to actually come and be with you today. So, I look forward to hearing the final set of recommendations.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you, Don. And now, Deputy Secretary Torres Small.

DEPUTY SECRETARY TORRES SMALL: Thank you very much, Chair Ein. Thank you Vice Chair Rosalyn Brewer. And thank you Deputy Secretary

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Graves, it's an honor to get to work with you on this. Secretary Vilsack sends his deepest gratitude for your service on this board. You've provided just vast experience, and practical recommendations, as well as a bold vision.

And the subject of today is a key example of that bold vision. So often we get caught up, especially when it comes to agriculture and the food systems, about the risks of artificial intelligence. How do we mitigate for cyber threats in dairies, how do we mitigate for impact to rural water utilities.

And this forces us to find opportunity And in the sector of agriculture and as well. our food supply, there are incredible opportunities when it comes to exports. When farmers, you don't always think about it, but they're some of the most tech savvy folks out there, because they're always trying to produce as efficiently as possible, and looking for any new technology to do that.

And so in the agriculture sector, you have AI identifying weds, addressing labor shortages, working to support plant health, working to address drought through very precise water application. You also have support when it comes to imports and exports facilitating looking at different ways we can review grades of meat for example, and also reduce the burden on USDA employees.

But there's also an opportunity for Because any time you're reducing markets. inputs, more precise pesticide application for example, you're also then creating a product that's more climate smart. And that, there's an incredible demand for that globally right now. If you're investing in biotech, and new genetic genomic sequences that are more drought resistant, that creates a new strain that we can sell to the world that's in high demand.

As long as we are working to maintain those free markets. And that's why actions here

to support export opportunities for farmers in the United States will continue to strengthen our global position. So, thank you for bringing this to the floor, thank you so much for your continued work and advice, and thank you for including USDA and the crucial agricultural sector to be part of this conversation.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you so much, and thanks for being here. And please pass on our appreciation to the Secretary. Obviously agriculture has been a big topic for this body over the last two years, and his presence, and engagement has been great, as well as yours, so thank you. Now, I'll turn it over to Deputy Secretary David Turk from the Energy Department.

DEPUTY SECRETARY TURK: Well, thank you, Chair, and Vice-Chair, and Don, and Xochitl for all of our partners. I don't think there's an area that's more vital for private public partnership than AI, and what we do on AI going forward. Not just from our economic competitiveness, but from a national security perspective as well.

So, really appreciate the recommendations, and all the work by this really esteemed group of folks, and I think it'll have lasting, lasting impact on that. Certainly from the Department of Energy side, we are all about AI, have been for actually many, many years, and decades actually in terms of our compute power.

We and our 17 national labs that you all as federal taxpayers have funded and the supported for decades have four of ten fastest super computers in the world. We've got an incredible wealth of data. We've got about 8 billion dollars a year that goes to science in our national laboratory system.

Huge amounts of data that can be incredibly helpful as the fuel, literally the fuel for this AI revolution, and of course phenomenal talent working with Don's team, and Xochitl's team, and teams across the government

to try to make all that available. There's a lot of offense to be played here certainly, just as Xochitl said, how important new technologies can be for farmers, and folks in rural parts of our country where I come from.

It can be incredibly helpful on the energy side, including developing new, innovative energy technologies of the future. We had a partnership with Microsoft, one of our national labs in the Pacific Northwest, and we used AI to boil down 23, or actually 32 million different potential chemistries that could work for advanced batteries down to 23 top candidates using AI.

That's the kind of thing that would have literally taken us years, and years, and decades to do manually, and we did that in an incredibly short amount of time to help make sure that we are on the cutting edge of the battery chemistry innovation side, which of course is incredibly competitive with China, but with other

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

countries around the world.

So, there's a lot of offense that we need to play, but I also think there's a lot of defense that we need to play when it comes to AI. I've sat in a lot of windowless rooms not too far from here, Don, and Xochitl, and others of us in this administration to make sure that we are doing right by the government's role.

To make sure that the worst -- some of the real negative repercussions, unintended consequences of AI, whether you're talking nuclear, through the nuclear weapons for the U.S. Government, and making sure that terrorists and others don't have a lower bar in terms of developing technologies that we don't think they should have, or bioweapons, or chemical weapons.

There's a lot of defense, and again, the private public partnership is absolutely key there. The two issues that I think I wanted to flag for this group in particular that we're focused on a lot, one is the additional

electricity use that these AI and data centers are happening in our country, but around the world as well.

We in our country have had relatively stable electricity demand for the last 15 or so years, that is changing, and changing in a big way. And every time we talk to our experts, the amount of additional electricity that we're expecting from data centers, and most of that is AI, the growth really on the AI side is quite dramatic.

We'll have some new numbers coming out from Lawrence Berkeley National Lab, which has been tracking this for literally decades, bottom up looking at the Nvidia chips, and other chips that are actually fueling this, so it's really good, solid numbers on what we're expecting. And it's quite striking what we'll see just over the next few year period of time.

So, be on the lookout for that, but I think that's just another data point. And

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

there's an opportunity here to work with these AI data center companies, work with all of you, as well as the users of this powerful technology to make sure that we're using this as a force to accelerate our clean energy transition to develop clean, firm power to make sure that we're achieving all of our goals at the same time.

The other thing I wanted to flag for this group is of course there was an election, where those of us who are political appointees for just a little bit longer. I get worried about what happens with such a critical technology, such a cutting edge technology, such a challenging technology to manage, think about the meetings we've had, Don, just recently over the last couple week period of time.

We need to make sure we're doing our part to pass the baton to make sure there's not slippage on the government side. But I think you all as industry leaders are part of the transition too, to make sure that there's not

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

slippage, and to make sure that we're all doing right by our responsibilities.

Both the opportunity side, but also channeling the more sinister parts of what could happen if we don't keep our eye on the ball on the AI side going forward. So, I just wanted to flag that part in particular too, Chair.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you so much, Deputy Secretary Turk, for those comments, and for being here. I now want to turn it over to someone who is a really dear friend, and someone who has been a great sounding board for me, and someone who has done an amazing job as CEO of the DFC, Scott Nathan.

MR. NATHAN: Well, Mark, thank you very much, and congratulations to you, and to all the members of the PEC on what you've accomplished during and for this administration. Very grateful, and it's great to be here with all my colleagues.

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So, the development finance

corporation is a relatively new agency, we just celebrated our fifth anniversary of our launch yesterday with an all-day conference. We're the only agency in the government dedicated to mobilizing capital to the private sector, that's all we do.

And we do that focused on developing I looked at the recommendations that markets. were prepared for this meeting, and I was very glad to see the mention of some of the markets where we work. There was the recommendation on AI export initiative for emerging markets, and while that's important to support, the dominance, predominance U.S. artificial the of the intelligence industry.

Make sure that standards are set in a way that promotes our interests, I think it's also just important to recognize the aspirations and growth potential in these markets. Whether we have an initiative for them or not, they're not going to stand still.

And it's important for us to be there in always, across all government, and especially private industry through investment to show up in the developing world, to offer an alternative that reflects our interests, and our values, and I'm glad that that includes thinking about AI. So, my agency generally is focused on supporting the private sector businesses, and investment infrastructure.

That includes a broad definition of infrastructure, digital infrastructure, the critical minerals and other inputs that are necessary to win the industries of the future, and especially access, as Dave mentioned, to reliable and abundant power, which is such a critical ingredient for the development potential of emerging economies around the world.

That's the single most important determinative of the development potential, development trajectory of these economies. A prime example of what we're doing is a 300 million

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

dollar loan facility for a company called Africa Data Centers, which does landing stations for subsea cables, and especially data centers throughout Africa.

Obviously directly connected to the ability of these communities, these economies to take advantage of the AI revolution. We're able to do that with strong interagency collaboration. My friend and colleague Don Graves sits on our board, I'm grateful for that. And I guess I'll just put in one final plea.

Don't forget these markets, I think it's critical for the future of the United States, it also happens to be the right thing to do for them and their futures. So, thanks for including me today.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you so much, Scott. Thanks to all of you people, leaders from across the federal government. It really matters a lot that you come to our meetings, and are engaged in our work, so we appreciate all of you for being

here. And in fact you guys all saw that the recommendation today touches each of your agencies, so thank you, thank you again.

With that, I'd like to turn it over to Dr. Jahanian to do an introduction of our AI recommendation.

DR. JAHANIAN: Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman. Deputy Secretary Graves, and Mr. Chairman, and fellow council members, it's my pleasure to present the council's recommendations on advancing U.S. leadership in AI, which are structured around five critical areas, in fact a number of speakers earlier alluded to some of these critical issues.

First set of recommendations focus on fostering growth and innovation, and highlighting the importance of a strategic investment in AI R&D, public private collaboration, and support for small businesses. We've emphasized the value of research investment, sector specific data sharing frameworks, and affordable access to computational resources, as was mentioned earlier.

The second set of recommendations focus on critical issues of ethics regulation, and standardization. Building on NIST's AI risk management framework. We advocate for robust ethical guidelines, global cooperation on governance, and AI safety benchmarks. This is so critical to ensuring responsible innovation while promoting public trust.

Our intellectual property recommendations recognize the complex and evolving landscape of IP in AI. We stress the need to address issues such as ownership of AI models, the role of AI and its data sources in inventoryship, and authorship, and protection of intellectual property across international markets.

The next group focuses on ensuring a robust workforce that can thrive alongside AI. And it's one of our nation's, of course, most

(202) 234-4433

critical imperatives. As a new report from the National Academies emphasizes, the most relevant concern is how exactly AI will shape the labor market value of human expertise.

targeted work We recommend force upscaling, new models for STEM education, inclusive apprenticeship, and close collaboration between industry and academia, and the government sectors.

Finally, the last set of recommendations called for investments in sustainable infrastructure and policies that balance AI driven innovation with resource conservation and environmental impacts, as was mentioned earlier.

As we open up the discussion, I want to highlight two really important key points that cut across, first is that fulfilling AI's promise requires an all of nation response. AI represents an unprecedented economic opportunity of course, and every sector of our economy is being reshaped.

Τn order to fulfill its inherent potential, we must continue to foster a vision for AI that can transcend candidly our already deep partisan divides, and bring benefits to all Americans, and certainly achieving our ΑI national bipartisan qoals will require leadership, strategic investment, and cross sector collaboration.

In particular I want to stress that the leadership of the federal government can ensure investments in AI infrastructure are made at a scale that the private sector cannot achieve alone. The second point, and the final point, it's important to recognize that securing the United States' global competitiveness in the age of AI will require focused export promotion and capacity building.

We need to keep in mind that AI is unlike traditional exports, it requires receptive ecosystems, and deep capacity building, including training local talent and building trust in how technology will be used. Of course continuing on this journey requires bold leadership and commitment to international diplomacy as a tool for strengthening economic ties that enhance critical global partnerships as we witnessed firsthand in Thailand.

Thank you again for giving me the opportunity to present our set of recommendations. Back to you, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you, Farnam, for that summary, and thanks for all you did to get the recommendation done, we're really blessed to have you and your team from Carnegie Mellon, it's a perfect institution to take the lead on this, so thank you. I know we want to hear from a number of our members I think, starting with Patrick Murphy.

MR. MURPHY: Thank you, Chair, and thank you all. As I think most of us probably agree, this is the most transformational

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

technology in our lifetime. And with that comes huge opportunity, but also tremendous responsibility. And we must strive to find this balance between supporting the largest U.S. companies.

But not forgetting about those small and mid-size companies that are often focused on those niche use cases that are often overlooked. And as the saying goes, artificial intelligence won't take your job, but the person using it probably will. So, we must focus on training and upscaling to ensure that this prosperity is shared amongst all of us.

And I happen to have two AI companies in the construction technology sector, and what I've seen is the following. An increase in job satisfaction and job pay, not displacement. Access to a lot more AI engineering talent abroad, which is not ideal. Confusion around IP for proprietary AI models.

Compute, that's very expensive,

especially if you're training your own model. And limited data sharing, which is obviously the goal with NAI. In our company we deal with blueprints, right? This isn't typically national security, but it's very difficult to get the tens or hundreds of thousands of plans necessary to train a model on.

And we're currently developing a model in our company that's going to reduce construction planning from years down to just weeks. This is going to save millions of dollars for consumers, and I believe help reduce and enable more work force housing, which as we all know is a crisis.

And that's just one use case. Imagine applying that to the U.S. Government. Whether it's Commerce, whether it's the VA, Social Security, Medicare, State Department, you name it. AI is a perfect tool to analyze and process these massive data sets. So, I'm hoping that government will work closer with the private

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

sector, as was mentioned, through public private partnerships and programs like the tech modernization fund.

And ultimately those successful companies I hope are supported through Commerce and other agencies to be expanded abroad, and make sure that American ethics, and regulations, and standards, et cetera, are shared far and wide. So, I appreciate everyone's leadership here, and hope we can continue this momentum.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you, Patrick, and thanks for all of you to shape this recommendation. Next we'd like to hear from Brett Isaac.

MR. ISAAC: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I want to continue to advocate, and echoing some of the sentiments here about inclusion into the conversations, and the advancement of this technology. Listening to the previous learnings that we've experienced with the growth of the tech sector, we must be intentional in our

(202) 234-4433

efforts to protect our most vulnerable populations.

And monitor the impacts that may come from the advent of this technology, but also to include those voices in the parameters that we set in the use of that technology to ensure that existing protections that are codified in our laws continue to play a role in protecting communities as we advance the technology.

And also monitoring the impacts, such as the energy demands that will be created out of this, and the resources that we use to facilitate the filling of that demand to ensure that that is done in an inclusive but also proactive way to ensure that we don't repeat the learnings we've experienced in the past.

The other is preventing economic barriers from access. We've experienced in the tech sector how companies become outsized in their influence in how a sector would work. And being preemptive about how we set those

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

32

parameters from the onset is going to be important that we ensure those parameters are established in appropriate places.

So, we appreciate the leadership from the counsel, and the advisement, and look forward to continued advocacy for the betterment of our country. So, appreciate it.

CHAIR EIN: Thanks so much, Brett, appreciate that. Next, Rich Lesser.

MR. LESSER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. And Farnum, thank you for the leadership of you and your team on this set of recommendations. I wanted to speak mainly on the environmental side, and the environmental impact of AI, and briefly touch on the responsible AI elements as well. The surge in demand that's coming that you alluded to, Deputy Secretary Turk, I think it's hard to realize just how big a change is coming.

The forecast of our team at BCG is 15 to 20 percent increase per year in demand after relatively flat demand through 2030. That would

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

be 100 to 130 gigawatts of data center demand, which is enough power to power two thirds of American households by 2030. It's just an unprecedented build that's coming, and that's qoinq to create pressure in addressing including environmental concerns, concerns related to carbon emissions.

And that's going to require really a joint effort between policy makers, along with the private sector, energy companies, AI hyper scalers, end users in order to address these challenges. In the recommendations there's two specific sets of actions I just think are worth calling out.

The first is how do we expedite the construction and the operational efficiency of the AI infrastructure we're building. The U.S. is really uniquely positioned to lead in sustainable AI infrastructure. We can build the technologies to help here at home, and to help the world to do that, and we can do it in a very collaborative way that draws on the public and private sector.

And if we can expedite the construction and the deployment time lines, we maximize resource use, we prevent the waste that's associated with delayed operations, and so that's one bucket. And then the second is a pure technology play that again can benefit the U.S. and the world in three areas.

In water, in energy demand, wind, solar, geothermal, nuclear carbon capture, as well as in hybrid AI, where we both use the data centers and AI at the edge. And if we can really accelerate those technologies, we not only reduce the environmental impact, we also provide the technologies that create export opportunities for U.S. companies all around the world.

And enhance U.S. Competitiveness at a time where that is increasingly challenged. And then just briefly, there's this tendency sometimes on responsible AI to think of it as a

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

constraint on business that's going to make it harder. I just want to highlight our research.

BCG research has said that when leaders are actively engaging in responsible AI, they achieve 58 percent more business benefits, are 17 percent more prepared to invest in how do you get responsible AI, and 22 percent more prepared to deal with regulations. And this is one of these places where policy makers and business can work together in effective ways.

We can both enhance the business benefits that we'll all receive from AI, and we can do it in a way that protects society. But collaboration makes sure those policies are well designed, and working together to that is incredibly important. So, those were in our recommendations, I just wanted to call both out, thank you.

CHAIR EIN: Thanks, Rich. And thanks also to you for all the work you did here, and your engagement, and the BCG team over the last two years, it's been extraordinarily helpful, so thank you. Any other members want to comment on the AI recommendation? Okay, are there any objections to the recommendations?

Okay, hearing none, I proclaim the recommendation adopted by the counsel. Well done everyone. Now I'd like to hear again from Deputy Secretary Graves.

DEPUTY SECRETARY GRAVES: Thank you so much, Mr. Chair. And I want to thank the PEC for these really thoughtful recommendations. I too had the chance to go through and read the recommendations earlier, and I highlighted all over the place just how useful they will be to us. You all know this, as AI is the most transformative technology of our time, it will likely change almost every aspect of industry.

Certainly will have an out sized impact on our society, it offers just tremendous opportunities to enhance productivity, to create new industries, and to maintain U.S. leadership in the global economy. But as you all have pointed out in the thoughtful recommendations, it also requires us to be very mindful, and clear eyed about the challenges that we have ahead in ensuring that this is done.

Recognizing the potential down sides, recognizing the way that it will likely change our work force in addition to our industries, and think the President recognized this when he Ι issued his executive order on AI last year. I'm proud of the work that we've been doing at the Department to advance AI safety Commerce in addition to the great work that Under Secretary Lago and the International Trade Administration team have been doing to think about the ways we engage the rest of the world.

I think the work that's being done out of NIST with the U.S. AI Safety Institute, some of the brightest minds in the world on this issue partnering with you all, we've collaborated with leaders in industry, academia, civil society, to

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

38

make sure that we get this right, because we only get one shot at it.

We've worked with our global partners, and our allies like through ITA to write the rules of the road on AI. Last month we launched the International Network of AI Safety Institutes, which is accelerating the critical information exchange that you all have recommended to us, and we're driving towards that common or compatible set of safety evaluations and policies that will unlock innovation, while also protecting against the down sides.

In October, the President helped to announce the release of the national security memorandum on AI, which is designed to galvanize federal government adoption of AI, and to advance the national security mission. And it's also designating the U.S. AI Safety Institute as the center of our whole of government approach to advance AI model testing and evaluation.

Something that you all have

(202) 234-4433

recommended, and that you're pushing us to move even faster on. It will empower the safety institute to collaborate with the national security and intelligence community, and to ensure that we're working in lock step with the private sector, with academia, with civil society to drive safe, secure, and trustworthy development and use of AI.

Everything that you've raised in your recommendation also fits in well with our ongoing technical work on AI guidelines and standards with our interagency partners that you see around the table continuing to promote awareness, and adoption of the AI risk management framework domestically and globally.

And following up on the executive order, NIST is increasing its own participation in the standard setting efforts on AI, piloting new ways that we can complement the standard development process. All that to say we've made tremendous progress over the last few years,

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

40

certainly super charged over the last year.

But that progress is only the tip of the iceberg. We have a lot more to do, your recommendations are absolutely critical to the work that we have going forward. I know, I think I speak for my colleagues when I say there is a lot more to do. It's going to help us navigate the challenges going forward.

Whether you're talking about energy, agriculture, helping small business, helping ensure that equitable and economically aligned development around the world, the U.S. has to be at the forefront, and these recommendations are just a fantastic guide for us to move forward. So with that, Mr. Chair, I turn it back to you, thank you.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you, Don. And one of the things that we heard this morning before the meeting was how the previous recommendations have actually been put into practice, and made a real impact, and really appreciate you, hearing

(202) 234-4433

how you think this AI recommendation will do the same, we'll look forward to following up. Next I'd like to hear from Deputy Administrator Syed.

DEPUTY ADMINISTRATOR SYED: Thank you so much, chairman. And I actually want to thank Dr. Jahanian for helping lead such thoughtful recommendations on this topic. Before I joined the administration I ran an AI company, and I spent -- this is the last, most recent leg out of my 25 years in Silicon Valley.

And one thing I can tell you, having seen the software revolution, and social media revolution, and now AI revolution, the innovation in every single one of these technologies came from smaller companies, from startups. With all due respect, not from big companies in the first phase.

You look at OpenAI, OpenAI got investment from Microsoft and others recently, but it was a nascent effort, an open source, not for profit nascent effort. So, as someone who

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

has the privilege to lead the Small Business Administration, it's great to see that SMEs, or SMBs are mentioned as a consumer of AI.

One thing that I would want to emphasize is that you also want them to be producer of AI, if you will. And I don't think that is strong enough. And there are a couple of reasons for that. One, again, the innovation capacity of entrepreneurs, innovators who are not beholden by existing product lines in big tech.

We've seen time and again it's how we have led the world. Secondly, within the government, and I've seen this, and we have some colleagues who run our tech here, the over reliance on big tech, it's one thing to have over reliance on big tech within the software world, which itself is problematic.

But I would go as far as to say that when it comes to AI, it becomes risky when you're relying on a couple of big players. Where you have data, and common data then being used to

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

build models. And so, I think as you move forward, and David said it very well, at this time of transition, the big elephant in the room, you are the stewards.

And those of us who will be joining you at the outset, and I'll be back in the private sector to make sure that these recommendations move forward, but also that we keep pushing the envelope in terms of making sure it's truly an inclusive track to build innovation.

And I don't mean inclusive just in a socioeconomic aspect, of course it has to be, but also from a standpoint I'm making sure that we are bringing on the startups, and the Patrick Murphys of the world, and those who are charging the innovation track. And that's where I think academia plays a very, very critical role, right?

Because you do have an incredible ecosystem in your communities. So, I just want to emphasize that both from the SBS approach, but also someone who had the experience of building this kind of tech from an innovation ecosystem. Thank you for the opportunity.

CHAIR EIN: Yeah, thank you for those really thoughtful insights. Thank you. Next we're going to hear from Ellie Collinson.

MS. COLLINSON: Thank you, Chairman. Dep Sec Graves, my former boss, good to see you. Good to see all my colleagues across the U.S. Government, and of course our members of the PEC, thank you so much for your service. I am the deputy director, chief operating officer, and the officer chief AI of the U.S. Trade and Development Agency, and the data officer, the workplace safety officer, and a bunch of other things.

And I just wanted to call attention to the fact that our agency is already supporting AI projects in emerging markets, and we look forward to continuing to coordinate, and hold hands with the rest of the U.S. Government in that regard. Loved seeing the recommendation in and amongst

(202) 234-4433

your report to the President.

With respect to grant funding, and project preparation, and partnership activities, our work will define the technical requirements for these infrastructure projects. We work with DFC, and with XM, and with others to attract financing for their implementation. And just as a reminder, our work is conducted by U.S. companies, so the very work that we do is also an export onto itself.

And when we are supporting these export projects right now, the areas that we've already begun to see some traction is cancer detection and treatment, weather forecasting, railroad safety, and digital customs activities. We are also looking at how to harness AI's potential by developing environmentally friendly ancillary infrastructure.

As Rich mentioned, clean power generation, smart grids, data centers, and water efficiency. And again, just wanted to stress

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that we are always excited to see references to emerging markets in any part of the work of this council, and continue to look forward to working with all of you in the private sector, and with the rest of the U.S. Government on this endeavor. Thank you.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you, Deputy Director Collinson. Next we're going to hear from EXIM Board Member Owen Herrnstadt.

MR. HERRNSTADT: Sorry, thank you very much. I know we don't have much time left, but the mandate of the Export Import Bank is to support U.S. exports that support U.S. jobs. AI obviously is an area we're deeply interested in. Obviously looking at how it can support U.S. jobs.

As I mentioned before, we also have our domestic financing initiative, Make More in America, which permits us to give the same tools of financing for domestic manufacturing, and domestic development of technologies when those

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

involve export oriented industries as well AI is something then that we are looking very seriously at as well.

I want to congratulate the council for a set of excellent and very comprehensive recommendations. I particularly am impressed by the comprehensiveness when it comes to job scaling, and when it comes to a really a just transition for those workers who will not be left behind. Thank you.

CHAIR EIN: Thanks, and thanks for being here as well, Deputy Director Collinson, you both have been really active in our work. And I appreciate what you just said, and one of the things that I appreciate about the way this council was formed is that we do have a full set of diverse and representative members who bring a lot of perspectives that get reflected into these recommendations.

And I'm really proud that the AI one does that as well, so thank you for those

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

comments. I think that's it, does anyone else want to talk about the AI? Okay.

MS. LEA: Thank you, if I might, I'm Thea Lea from the Department of Labor. And just wanted to also join everybody in expressing appreciation for the recommendations, and the work of the PEC. I think what the document does is do a good job balancing the tremendous power, and potential of AI with also some cautionary notes, as you said, Deputy Secretary Graves.

And just like three key points that I wanted to lift up about worker protections in particular. And I think one of the key things is that as we're at the outset of doing this work, that it is better, and makes more sense to build in worker protections, and worker considerations at the foundation, and not as an afterthought.

But the first is also reinforcing how important it is to include workers and worker organizations, and unions in the development and implementation of these policies. It talks a

49

little bit about users of AI in small businesses, but workers are also users of AI, and also I think bring a lot of valuable insights to that conversation.

But also I'm going to talk about job creation, which is so important, but we also want to make sure that we're relying on some of the good work that Commerce and Labor have done together on the good jobs initiative, and making sure that we're thinking about the quality of jobs.

And I think one thing that we don't think about enough is that's important not just in the United States of America, but also as we do this overseas work. I was in Kenya recently, and I met with some of the workers who are doing the content management, and these are the workers who sit in front of a screen and review Facebook or TikTok videos for content, and it can be pretty traumatic.

And I would say just from the folks

that I met with, and we don't think about that as often, we don't think about sort of what that looks like. So, the hidden workers, the invisible workers that are there, but also that as we do this work, and as we support the private sector investments overseas, that we are also thinking about worker protections.

So, those were the key points I wanted to make. But again, to thank the PEC for the wonderful work, and the recommendations, thank you so much.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you, and thanks for being here. Anyone else want to comment on the AI? Okay, I think we're going to now move to final interventions about the PEC and our term starting with Farnam again.

DR. JAHANIAN: Well, thank you very much, I'll be very brief. First of all, I'm grateful for the opportunity to serve on President's Export Council, a real privilege to collaborate with such a distinguished group of

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

51

colleagues on this council, and also grateful, Mark, for your leadership, and Ros, for your leadership of the council.

I do want to once again express my gratitude to Secretary Raimondo for her leadership during the last several years. Ι think while she's not here, Ι do want to acknowledge that she has championed policies that drive technological innovations, and also have redefined how industry, government, and academia can collaborate.

The final point that I want to make is that her unwavering commitment, with the support of the President, of course, the team has made a lasting impact on the nation, and we're grateful for her service.

Before I wrap up, I do want to say that the work of this council is much more impactful as a result of the staff in the Commerce Department, and the team that's behind the Secretary and the Deputy Secretary that support

52

the work.

I know our team has worked with the staff, the team, and really grateful to them. If I start mentioning names I'm going to miss people, but I do want to acknowledge Jamie, Tricia, and Martin especially for all the great work that they have done. Thank you, it's been a real privilege.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you, Farnam. Paul Laudicina?

MR. LAUDICINA: Thanks, Mr. Chairman. I just want to obviously applaud, and endorse what Farnam just said, and Don, I'm sure you will extend our appreciation to the Secretary for her inspiring leadership. I'm quite proud, I think like all of us around the table, of the eight recommendations that we've made over the period of 23 months or so that we've been together.

And I value the opportunity, like Farnam, to work, and learn from all of my colleagues here around the table. And I believe

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

the recommendations reflect how the principles of fair and open economic relationships, which also protect the legitimate interests of workers and indigenous people, can provide for robust economic growth from which everyone can benefit.

And I think all that in the context of public private partnerships is exceedingly important, and has been the underpinning of all of the recommendations that we have made here. So, it's my profound hope that successor export councils, if there are successor export councils, would build on our work, and be guided by these same principles going forward. So, thank you, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you, Paul. Assistant Secretary Holman?

MS. HOLMAN: Thank you very much, it's my great honor to be here, and to thank you for all of the work that you have all done. It's really great to see what government, and business can do, and really appreciate the comments in the

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

54

ag space as well, as we all work together to support not just our workers, but our farmers.

I'd also like to say one quick word about the work that the State Department has been engaging on in the AI space as part of the October 2023, I think it was, executive order we were tasked to put together a play book, and to work on international partnerships. Secretary Blinken on the margins of UNGA back in September launched a partnership with many of the high tech companies, and AI companies to take this work overseas to do what many of you have mentioned around the table.

To create a more inclusive, equitable space where we can make sure that there's a level playing field, and that the rules of the road that we've started to develop in our work at the UN can be implemented. So, thank you for all your great work, and look forward to carrying this work forward as one of the people who will be here throughout the transition. Thank you.

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

CHAIR EIN: Thank you so much for that. Don, turn it over to you.

DEPUTY SECRETARY GRAVES: Let me just start by saying what I said throughout, and that is just a big thank you. Thank you certainly for your recommendations today, but the other sets of recommendations that you provided. Having staffed, as I mentioned, a federal advisory committee, I know just how much work the members put in individually with their teams, and as a collective body.

I know that you probably could be doing other things, you also -- many of you are coming to Washington from far flung places, probably don't have the rides that Brett has, so it's maybe not as easy to get here, but thank you. Global services member, so I appreciate you.

But as we close this chapter of the President's Export Council, I would encourage you all to take the time to reflect on what you've

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

done. It is not easy to come together as a group from very diverse places, organizations, backgrounds, and approaches, and come up with consensus recommendations like these that are not just pretty wallpaper, but they're actually the meaty recommendations that the federal government can use going forward.

They are part of the public record, we will continue to use and so them as а government, and those of us who like beina involved in policy making, we'll use it for many, many years to come. On behalf of the Secretary And I can say and of the President, I thank you. that on behalf of the President because I've worked with him, for him for a long time.

Anyone who has ever gotten a call from him, or met with him in person, Paul, I'm looking at you, you know that he would say hey, Don, it's Joe, this matters. He would say this matters. So, I continue to carry on this work as you go forward in your individual capacities. But maybe

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

working together in either a different iteration of this, or in a different capacity, working together to ensure a brighter and more prosperous future for all Americans.

And I have to go back again, and say Ros, Mark, thank the two of you for the work that you've done. It is not an easy thing to chair and vice-chair a group like this. So, your leadership has been phenomenal, and I hope that the incoming administration has the type of PEC, even a tenth of the type of PEC that we've had will be pretty phenomenal. So, thank you for your leadership, and with that I will turn it back to, I think the Vice-Chair.

VICE-CHAIR BREWER: Thank you, Deputy Secretary Graves, I think we all accept your challenge to keep this work ever present. It's been an honor and a pleasure to serve. I look forward to seeing the realities of this work, and I'm grateful for this team. They made it easy for Chair Ein and myself to get this work done,

(202) 234-4433

but it came with a lot of hard work from the team that we've recognized earlier.

So, thank you very much for everything, and to Deputy Secretary Graves, I'm sure you'll share this with Secretary Raimondo, that we took her charge seriously. When she spoke with Mark and I, she made sure that we understood how important this work was. So, your partnership with thank you for the Secretary, and thank you for everyone in this room.

CHAIR EIN: Thank you. Thanks, Don, and thanks Ros. So, as we bring this meeting and our term to a close, I think as Farnam said, there's too many people to thank individually. But if you do indulge me, I just do want to call out a couple people in particular, starting with our extraordinary Commerce Secretary Gina, who unfortunately is sick, not here, maybe you're watching us here.

If you are, I do want to say that we've

all seen firsthand how hard you work, how you work with grace on behalf of our country, and you've been an incredibly powerful ally for American industry, and extremely effective at furthering the President's inclusive economic agenda, it's been a true pleasure to work with you.

And as Ros just said, from the very beginning, you gave us a vision of what we could accomplish with the PEC, and pushed us hard to do that, and I hope we've made you proud. You also have an amazing team, Don, at Commerce. You've heard people thank them specifically, but I do want to call out Marisa Lago.

Marisa, thank you, from the verv beginning, yeah. You've really been an invaluable source of wisdom since the very beginning, we're grateful for that. The incomparable Tricia Van Orden, where is Tricia? Thank you, Tricia. You've led our work since the beginning, and you definitely have the mantle of

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

knowing more about PECs than anyone alive.

And without that, we couldn't have done what we did, so thank you. Jamie Merriman, who has stepped in here in the last couple meetings, and executed flawlessly, thank you so much for all that you've done, Jamie, thank you. I would say that each of these people aren't just a tribute to the Commerce Department, but really to public servants everywhere.

And for those of us who work in the private sector, having a chance to see up close how good the people are who dedicate their lives to our country, has been a really special part of this experience, so thank you all. I also want to thank all of my fellow members, Ros, our Vice-Chair, and our members who represent leadership from corporate America, labor, academia.

And everyone dedicated a really meaningful amount of time over the last two years to make our work possible. We talked earlier about how proud we are of the diverse set of

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(202) 234-4433

perspectives and voices that were included in the work that we did, and we delivered, so thank you all.

I think we've built a lot of professional and personal friendships as well that I hope will endure amongst us. And then really the unsung heroes of the PEC, who are the people who work for the members. Before this I mentioned that we had actually 30 Zoom meetings in preparations for our meetings that involved over 100 people.

And so much of the work that's reflected in the recommendations is the people not sitting at the table, but around the table, and I really want to please ask us to give them a round of applause for all that they've done. Last, just in terms of appreciation, I want to thank President Biden for the honor of this appointment.

I know all of our members share that, and also to thank him for an extraordinary life of public service. So, I want to thank the President. Collectively, so much went into these eight recommendations, and we touched many of the largest and most strategic sectors of the U.S. economy.

And just it's worth as we close, just reflecting on the breadth of the work that we did in innovation and technology, trade facilitation, agriculture, climate, manufacturing, our trip to Asia related to IPEF trade and services, and today, AI, and from the beginning our goal was not just to make recommendations, but to make real impact, and to follow up, and follow through.

So, we were really grateful, Marisa, for your report on how each of these recommendations actually impacted what the U.S. Government did, and how it then made an impact in the real world. And so, there's not a better way to close out the meeting and our term than to think about the fact that all this work actually

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

has mattered to date, and hopefully will continue.

And then just on a broader level, I think that the breath and quality of this work that's been accomplished in such a short period of time hopefully demonstrates the power of bringing the private sector, and the public sector to work together to benefit our country through bodies like this.

As we close the work of the Export Council today, I hope that this body of work ensures that this kind of public private collaboration continues and flourishes without pause, again, and long into the future. To everyone who has been part of this, I hope you share my pride, and our pride in our collective work, and above all thank you.

Thank you to each of you. And with that, the final meeting of President Biden's Export Council is now adjourned.

(Whereupon, the above-entitled matter

went off the record at 11:34 a.m.)

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309